"FOURTH WORLD" VALUES IN A SPANISH-LANGUAGE NEWSPAPER SERVING AN IMMIGRANT COMMUNITY

RICHARD J. PELTZ-STEEL

This study operationalized the Four Worlds model for mass media values in a new context — that of a foreign-language newspaper serving a recent-immigrant community within a First World society, namely a Hispanic community in central Arkansas, in the United States. The study established baseline representations of previously described "First World" and "Fourth World" values in a mainstream central Arkansas newspaper, and in Cherokee and Koori newspapers. The study speculated that the central Arkansas Hispanic community exists with a measure of physical and cultural separation from mainstream society — arising from informal barriers such as socioeconomic status, residential neighborhoods, language, and racism — and that this separation is analogous to the separation of a Fourth World society from its mainstream society. Accordingly, the study predicted that El Latino content would bear greater similarity with the Fourth World baseline than with the First World baseline. The hypothesis was substantially but not wholly born out. El Latino tracked the Fourth World baselines on six of the thirteen values surveyed, First and Fourth World, and results were inconclusive on six more values, two because El Latino fell between the baselines. El Latino tracked the First World baseline on only one value: First World "oddity." It was hoped that this study will stimulate further research into similarities between immigrant groups and Fourth World communities, that they might share in the development of innovative strategies in their common pursuit of socioeconomic development for their peoples while preserving their cultural integrity and ethnic identity.

Richard J. Peltz-Steele is a professor of law at the University of Massachusetts Law School (rpeltzsteele@umassd.edu).

Keywords: acculturation, content analysis, ethnic media, Fourth World, immigration, newspaper

The concept of a “Fourth World,” complementing the traditional Three Worlds model, contemplates a society within a society, usually an indigenous people living in the aftermath of a colonial occupation. The Fourth World is still surrounded, geographically, politically, and culturally, by the former colonial power, yet the Fourth World people do not enjoy the same standard of living as their “First World” counterparts. Moreover, the political, cultural, and economic independence of the Fourth World people may be in a state of development and ambiguity in relation to the former colonial power. This condition describes, for example, the Koori of Australia, and the First Nations of North America.

Globalization, cross-border migration, and economic insecurity bring another population, one as yet unrepresented in the Four Worlds model, to the fore of political debate and cultural awareness: communities of immigrants from developing countries to First World countries. This community has much in common with the Fourth World, as especially recent immigrants might live in social and economic conditions that are, on average, substandard in relation to their First World counterparts. The immigrant community might be isolated by barriers such as language and culture, by the political boundaries of neighborhoods, and by the social alienation of prejudice. Like the people of the Fourth World, the immigrant community has an ambiguous relationship with its First World society. The immigrant community desires at once to preserve its social independence and ethnic identity, while also participating in the First World community to enjoy the political, social, and economic benefits of citizenship.

The Four Worlds model has been adapted to the context of mass media to study the value systems that are reflected and perpetuated in the “Third World” and, researched to a lesser extent, in the Fourth World. These studies have served to shed light on these communities and the role of the media in serving or hindering social and economic development, while reinforcing or disintegrating ethnic identity, as well as the role of media in performing traditional functions in those communities, such as government accountability and public communication.

No research yet, however, has examined immigrant communities in the First World according to the Four Worlds model. Finding a place in the Four Worlds model for immigrant-oriented media might help Fourth World and immigrant communities to share their common experiences in mapping their own courses toward social and economic development, while resolving the tension between acculturation and ethnic identity.

To these ends, this study conducted a comparison of the content of four newspapers, one a Spanish-language weekly newspaper serving an immigrant community within the First World United States; one a traditional, English-language daily serving the same U.S.
geographic market as the weekly; and two principally English-language newspapers, a fortnightly serving the Koori in Australia, and a monthly serving the Cherokee Nation in the United States. The study anticipated that the newspapers serving First and Fourth World populations would reflect the respective “news values” outlined by Robie (2001, p. 13). However, the study predicted that the Spanish-language U.S. newspaper would bear greater resemblance to the Fourth World models than to the First, even though it serves the same First World geographic market as the latter. This prediction arose from the observations that the immigrant community served by the Spanish-language newspaper occupies a discrete space within the host society, both figuratively, in dimensions such as language and socioeconomic attainment, and literally, in dimensions such as neighborhoods; and that this separation from the host society is strikingly reminiscent of the relationship between a Fourth World community and its First World counterpart. Accordingly, the foreign-language newspaper may merit recognition as reflective of a unique class of content values, perhaps a reflection of the community’s evolving relationship with the host society.

FOURTH WORLD

George Manuel, of the Shuswap Nation in present-day British Columbia, Canada, described “the Fourth World” (Manuel & Posluns, 1974). Manuel generalized the plight of the Shuswap to describe indigenous people around the world. “Aboriginal World” societies bear a “common bond” in two respects: first, in political, religious, economic, and cultural experiences distinct from those of the Third World, which adapts and imitates Western models; and second, in their interdependence of culture and land, as distinct from First World concepts such as kingdom, freehold, and alienation.

Russell (1996) defined the “Fourth World” as “the indigenous peoples with third world living conditions residing within first world countries” (p. 59). The Fourth World “cannot separate from imperial power because of their location within the boundaries of the imperialist nation” (Robie, 2008, p. 104), but Russell (1996) posited that a constructive sort of “decolonization” (pp. 57, 65-67)—not actually resulting in the physical departure of the colonizers, but resulting in a reconceptualized balance of integrated power and mutual autonomy—would allow Fourth World people in Australia, Canada, New Zealand, and the United States to realize their national identities and achieve Manuel’s ultimate vision. Meanwhile, though, Fourth World societies find themselves torn between the competing objectives of “political autonomy,” on the one hand, and “equal access to the political and economic opportunities of the democratic society,” on the other hand (Robie, 2008, p. 104).

Robie (2008) cited the *Koori Mail* as a prototype of Fourth World newspapers. Application of the Four Worlds model to media is important because the First World ‘objectivity’ paradigm, which dominates materials in journalism education, does not truly reflect how journalism is practiced in most of the world, which is developing (Robie 2008). Third and Fourth World value systems offer an alternative model for journalism that acknowledges the developing social and economic conditions in which journalists work in different countries and regions of the world. This alternative model challenges the traditional First World paradigm of objective detachment in a manner akin to the challenge public journalism poses to the traditional model within the First World. Accordingly, development journalism and public journalism are discussed below.

The further alternative of a Fourth World media model has been important to acknowledge the conflicting pressures and hybrid socioeconomic circumstances of journalists serving Fourth World societies. Robie (2008) asserted “an important role” (p. 104) for Fourth World media in expressing and resolving the indigenous struggle between political and cultural autonomy, on the one hand, and political and economic participation in the dominant society, on the other hand. If immigrant communities exist in a space similarly discrete from their host societies, and struggle with conflicting priorities in a manner similar to Fourth World peoples, as this paper posits, then a formulation of the unique values of the media serving the immigrant community will aid in understanding how immigrating peoples relate to their host societies, and perhaps how they can better develop socioeconomically while preserving their ethnic identity.

While naturally there is a danger of generalization in employing the Four Worlds model to analyze journalism across nations and cultures, it offers at least one mode of inquiry superior to the generalization of the idealistic First World paradigm to all the world, which was the norm in media research for much of the 20th century.

In Robie’s formulation, First World media are expected to reflect First World values.
to the exclusion of Fourth World values, but Fourth World media are expected to incorporate both classical First World values and the special-interest values of the Fourth World model (Chung, 1984). Aside from Robie’s work, however, there is a dearth of empirical research on Fourth World journalism.

**THIRD WORLD AND DEVELOPMENT JOURNALISM**

A considerable body of research has examined journalism as it is practiced in developing countries, *i.e.*, “development journalism” and “Third World” journalism. These close cousins of Fourth World journalism merit attention because, as Russell (1996) and Robie (2008) observed, it is Third World conditions and Third World values that exert pressure on Fourth World cultures, in tension with First World values.

The Third World paradigm has usefully acknowledged the circumstances in which most of the world’s journalists live and work. In contrast with the detached objectivity of the First World ideal, development journalists “share the sentiments of the people in social situations and are changed to some degree as well as changing the situation as reporters. They have a moral obligation to their readership and audience” (Robie, 2008, p. 102). Understanding how this role differs from the First World paradigm is essential to define the rights and responsibilities of the journalist in relation to “good governance, freedom of speech, human rights and executive power” within the particular dynamics of a developing nation (Robie, 2008, p. 104).

Soola (2003a) explicated the post-colonial world history of social and economic development from the 1960s to the 1990s. In 1970, Chalkley published the *Manual of Development Journalism*, which urged reporters to recognize the cycle of poverty in the developing world, and to “promot[e]” to readers, “to open their eyes to the possible solutions” (pp. 1-2).

Hester (1987) explained that Third World journalists cannot depend on consistency in political regimes, stability in infrastructure, or literacy in readers. Third World journalists thus bear particular responsibilities, such as educating readers, holding a mirror up to leaders, role modeling for youth, and amplifying the “needs, hopes, and fears” of the pedestrian community (pp. 6-9). Bhattacharjea (2005) emphasized the focus of development journalism on ordinary people and accountability for social services. Localization and rural reach are key to this focus, which rejects “elitist, urban-orient[ation]” and does not depend on the “traditional five-W format,” rather is licensed to “evoke interest and sympathy” with the subjects of stories (pp. 3, 8).

Some Third World advocates have argued that a government-media alliance is desirable or necessary for Third World societies to achieve economic development, while others worry over the implications of government power for the freedom and independence
of the press. This tension was examined by Soola (2003c) and exhaustively by Chung (1984). Chung concluded that while there is merit in the contributions of journalism to development through government-allied values such as education and inspiration, the surveillance and inspection functions of the news media, independent and critical of government, remain essential to national development. Another noteworthy study is Lee’s (1986), in which he compared newspaper history and content across four former British colonies and identified an unexpected “negative correlation between development journalism and economic growth” (p 126). At the same time, however, he found “no systematic relationship between authoritarianism/totalitarianism and the practice of development journalism” (p. 261), a finding bolstered by Romano (1998) studying Indonesian journalists.

Researchers have conducted numerous other case and country studies of development journalism, focusing on developing Asia (McKay, 1993), the South Pacific (Robie, 2008), Indonesia (Tamin, 1992; Tobing, 1991), Nigeria (Soola, 2003b; Edeani, 1993), the African Yoruba (Salawu, 2003), and various African countries (Spencer-Walters, 1987).

PUBLIC JOURNALISM

The additional paradigm of “public journalism” also merits mention. Public journalism (also “civic journalism” or “communitarian journalism”) represents a socially conscious model of journalism that elevates social responsibility over classical First World objectivity. A distinctively First World, post-industrial movement, public journalism traces its recent recognition substantially to 1990s media criticism in North America (Rosen, 1992; Charity, 1995; Merritt, 1995), but can be traced to roots in the 1920s (Haas, 2007). Public journalism has been treated thoroughly (Black, Ed., 1997; Glasser, Ed., 1999a; Haas, 2007) and is the raison d’etre of non-governmental organizations such as the Public Journalism Network (Witt, Ed., 2009) and the Center for Community Journalism and Development (2009).

Both public and Third World journalism emphasize the social mission of the journalist, the former eschewing the classic First World theory of self-expression in favor of community self-governance (Glasser, 1999a), and the latter positing values in community integration and social responsibility (Robie, 2008). Yin (1996) observed that despite juxtaposed ties to authoritarianism and democracy, both development and public journalism emerged from dissatisfaction with conventional journalism, and both aim to effect social change through journalistic involvement rather than detachment. Hoskins (1997) suggested that public journalism might provide a needed avenue for Mexican journalism to progress from a state of development-model subordination to authoritarian government controls, to a state of independence in fostering civic participation in the democratic tradition.

Public journalism initiatives have been identified in Australia, Japan, and New Zealand, as well as developing countries, Argentina, Colombia, Mexico, Malawi, Senegal,
and Swaziland (Haas, 2007), but commonality between public and Fourth World journalism in particular has not been investigated in the literature.

**ETHNIC AND IMMIGRANT MEDIA**

The 2008 Editor and Publisher *International Yearbook* listed more than 100 ethnic newspapers, besides Hispanic media, serving communities from Afghan to Vietnamese. The penetration of ethnic media in the U.S. media marketplace has been noted for some time, from 1732 (Kanellos with Martell, 2000; Kelly, 1985), to the 1900s (Paul, 2001a), to present, and ethnic-media business dynamics have been studied and tracked (New California Media 2005; Pew Project for Excellence in Journalism 2004, 2005, 2006, 2007, 2008, 2009). Marketing in the United States in the 1980s “discovered” Spanish-language media as a means to access a vast audience, then-as-yet under-tapped (Rodriguez, 1999, p. 41).

Ethnic media should not be confused with immigrant media, as Kanellos and Martells (2000) observed that First Nations media, always, and African-American media, for generations, have been the former and not the latter. But a fine line divides the two, so some obfuscation is unavoidable (Miller, 1987). Even if immigrant communities transformed in linear fashion into ethnic minority groups, and perhaps then into dominant culture—they do not, as the next section explains—community is difficult to define amid ongoing immigration, and there are no defining moments of transformation. Accordingly, media play an evolving role throughout the life of the community, whatever its course relative to the dominant culture (Johnson, 2000; Kanellos with Martells, 2000; Viswanath and Arora, 2000). In light of vibrant Latino immigration at present, a distinction between Latino immigrant and ethnic media in recent decades is not highly salient here.

Research on Latino media in the United States has consistently recognized a tension between preservation of immigrant culture vis-à-vis host culture, and integration between immigrant and host culture (Kanellos with Martells, 2000; Rodriguez, 1999). This tension plays out in news values. Born of the U.S. marketplace, U.S. Latino media generally reflect the dominant First World ideal of objectivity (Rodriguez, 1999). But that ideal is mitigated by a powerful allegiance to the immigrant community. The result can be compared with public journalism: “Latino journalism absorbs the objectivity ideal into a public service orientation” (Rodriguez, 1999, p. 88). This community focus fosters intense reader loyalty (Kelly, 1985; Paul, 2001b). A number of studies have examined the consequent impact of ethnic media on political affairs (Donelle, Hoffman-Goetz & Clarke, 2004; Hoffman-Goetz, Shannon & Clarke, 2003; Félix, González & Ramírez, 2008; Friedman & Hoffman-Goetz, 2006; Jeffres, 1999; Lindaman, 2004; Olzak & Westbrook, 1991).

Content analyses have revealed differences between U.S. Latino and host-culture media that accord with “Latino objectivity” (Rodriguez, 1999, p. 84) and are suggestive of
Fourth World values. Latino media emphasize news from Latin America, with or without a local peg (Kelly, 1985; Miller, 1987; Rodriguez, 1999), sometimes to filter information back into repressive regimes (Kanellos with Martell, 2000). Spanish-language media obviously perpetuate identity as expressed through language, and sometimes simultaneously perpetuate culture with the publication of Spanish-language literary and entertainment products, such as poetry (Kanellos with Martell, 2000). Where Latino and mainstream media cover the same stories, the former tends to a culturally independent and critical perspective, demonstrated by peg, such as the immigration proposals of political candidates, and by sourcing, which emphasizes Latino commentators but may deemphasize the voices of other cultural minorities (Kanellos with Martell, 2000; Kelly, 1985; Rodriguez, 1999). Latino media content furthermore emphasizes education, civil rights, and sociopolitical advocacy (Kanellos with Martell, 2000; Kelly, 1985; Miller, 1987; Rodriguez, 1999). Media publish practical information, from holiday schedules to job boards, to aid recent immigrants in adjusting to daily life in a new place (Miller, 1987; Paul, 2001b; Walker, 1999). Members of the community successful in labor, education, and athletics are held up as role models (Kelly, 1985; Rodriguez, 1999). Latino media furthermore perpetuate culture by reinforcing values related to family, religion, and gender roles (Kanellos with Martell, 2000; Paul, 2001b).

The particular culture perpetuated by Latino media is unique. Aside from highly local media serving readers homogenous in national origin, Latino media downplay national and cultural differences between readers and reinforce instead a pan-ethnic Latino identity (Rodriguez, 1999). Conciously constructed even through language choices, pan-ethnic identity empowers the community through internal solidarity, and cultivates the media audience by transcending the diverse immigrant experiences of, for example, Cubans, Salvadorians, and Chileans. The result is a "renationalized" cultural identity that is distinctly of the United States, but apart from the dominant culture (Rodriguez, 1999, pp. 75-81).

Researchers have previously recognized the importance of studying immigrant communities through their media, and in doing described immigrant communities in terms strikingly reminiscent of Fourth World cultural study. Kanellos and Martells (2000) described the mission of Latino media as "pursuit of self-expression and self-definition as a people within the cultural and geographic borders of a multicultural nation" (p. 119). Miller (1987) explained that "[t]he press is the best single source for an understanding of the world of non-English-speaking groups in the United States, their expectations and concerns, their background and evolution as individual communities" (p. xii). Miller furthermore emphasized the need for further content analysis of ethnic and immigrant media "to trace historical and sociological developments, examine social structure, and analyze groups' mores as they are distinguished from mainstream society" (p. xx).
ASSIMILATION, ACCULTURATION, AND THE ARKANSAS HISPANIC COMMUNITY

Considerable research has examined the relationship between immigrant communities and their host societies. Initially this relationship was perceived in terms of a linear and progressive development of the immigrant community toward a state of complete assimilation in the host society. While assimilation continues to be an important part of the immigrant-host relationship, substantially more complex models emerged amid research into 20th-century migrations (Alba & Nee, 2001).

Most importantly, the immigrant-host relationship is a two-way street of acculturation. This acculturative transformation has been described as a convergence, in which the immigrant and host cultures both change, converging in a new society (Alba & Nee, 2001; Rumbaut, 1999; Suárez-Orozco, 2001a). Elements of the immigrant culture—whether food (tortillas in the United States), language (“Spanglish”), or even abstract values (family, marriage)—can lose their ethnic associations and become characteristic of the converged society.

Moreover, the transformation of the immigrant-host society is not necessarily linear, nor necessarily progressive (Rumbaut, 1999). The path of the immigrant community has been described as “bumpy,” changes occurring in fits and starts (Alba & Nee, 2001, p. 9; Rumbaut, 1999, p. 188). Indeed, the problem may be examined in multiple dimensions, such as language, culture, and political participation (Alba & Nee, 2001; Foner, 1999; Rumbaut, 1999). Researchers have identified language as the most reliably linear and progressive dimension, manifesting a generational pattern of abandonment of the origin language in favor of the host language (Rumbaut, 1999). Transformation may be mapped in different patterns for the same population, depending on the dimension analyzed.

It is not inevitable that an immigrant culture will move forward, insofar as its transformation is linear, nor that the condition of the immigrant community, in dimensions such as education, economic attainment, and public health, will progress to a better state, even after emigration from the developing world. Factors such as language barriers, racism, and economic adversity in the host country can yield socioeconomic regression and alienation, whether as a temporary setback or a longer-term condition (Alba & Nee, 2001; Bean, Chapa, Berg, & Sowards, 1994; Rumbaut, 1999; Suárez-Orozco, 2001a; Zhou, 1999).

In fact, there is an open question as to whether patterns of assimilation or acculturation witnessed in the 20th century will persist at all (Gans, 1999; López, 1999). The 1960s civil rights era is passed. Migrating persons today more often appear as persons of color, thus are more conspicuous than their European predecessors (Perlman & Waldinger, 1999). Migration today is not confined to discrete waves, but is an ongoing process. And the world is in the grip of an economic crisis. Perhaps most saliently, globalization and communication...
technology have created a world in which immigrant persons maintain vibrant ties with societies of origin. While acculturation never required that a minority group utterly shed its ethnic identity, the tech-savvy descendants of immigrants today are capable of forming compound identities: "transnationals" easily sliding between worlds (Suárez-Orozco, 2001a, pp. 60-63; Suárez-Orozco, 2001b, p. 220; Trueba, 2004, pp. 37-43, 71-85).

Hispanic immigration in the United States offers ripe ground for migration research, because several factors indicate that these immigrant communities will relate to the host society in an unprecedented fashion. Hispanic immigration is marked by its ongoing stream and high volume, which prompt more than usual movement by the host culture toward convergence. For example, even language might not follow its usual assimilative, linear, and progressive pattern (López, 1999; Trueba, 2004). Large immigrant communities and increasing bilingualism in host communities mitigate the predominance of English, while globalization and technology perpetuate bilingualism among youth. Meanwhile Hispanic immigrants tend to appear as persons of color, thus remain conspicuous in many parts of the country. Amid economic stresses, real problems arising from illegal immigration, and the civil rights era dated by generations, cultural convergence might be slowed by alienation and racism.

Arkansas, in the United States, is an apt locality for this study. Using data from the 2000 U.S. Census, 2005 American Community Survey, and 2005 Current Population Survey Annual Social and Economic Supplement, Capps, Henderson, Hernandez, & Fix (2007) determined that Arkansas had the fastest growing Hispanic population, per capita, of any U.S. state between 2000 and 2005. More than half of the foreign-born Arkansas population in 2005 immigrated in 1995 or later, a more recently immigrated population than the U.S. national average (Capps et al., 2007). Also exceeding the national average in 2005, two-thirds of Arkansas immigrants came from Latin America, almost half from Mexico (Capps et al., 2007). Using Urban Institute analysis of data from the 2004 and 2005 U.S. Current Population Survey Annual Social and Economic Supplements, and relying on Passel (2005) to classify the legal status of survey respondents, Capps et al. (2007) determined that more than half of Arkansas immigrants were undocumented, an excess over the national average. Undocumented status reinforces social isolation by depriving persons of full participation in the political and economic community of the host society. In 2005, four Arkansas counties—including Pulaski, which includes the capital city of Little Rock, in central Arkansas—were home to almost two-thirds of immigrants (Capps et al., 2007). Supplementing their data with information from the Arkansas Department of Education, Capps et al. demonstrated that Arkansas immigrants share low levels of educational and economic attainment relative to the U.S.-born population.

These circumstances suggest comparison with the Four Worlds model. Hispanic-immigrant communities in Arkansas are not part of the First World, nor part of the Third. Immigrant communities have coalesced around pan-ethnic commonalities such as language,
religion, and food (López, 1999). Their isolation from mainstream Arkansas culture is reinforced by barriers such as language, economic attainment, and racism (Zhou, 1999). Predominantly Hispanic neighborhoods have come into being, complete with ethnic food and Spanish-language business signs. Their borders are not fixed on any map, but they are well known locally. While these neighborhoods resemble the ethnic enclaves of 20th-century European immigrants in U.S. cities, the changed circumstances of contemporary migration mean that these Hispanic enclaves might not yield to cultural convergence as readily or rapidly as their predecessors (Bean et al., 1994).

These communities might instead represent a new form of Fourth World society: an ethnically minority, socioeconomically disadvantaged “world” contained within a host, First World society. Using the Four Worlds model, study of the media that serve this world might bolster the comparison. The role of mass media in acculturation has been studied little (Rumbaut, 1999). Moreover, recognition of similarities between contemporary immigrant communities and long established Fourth World societies might foster recognition of common interests. Research has demonstrated that immigration and acculturation are highly stressful experiences, threatening social stability and family integrity (Smart & Smart, 2001; Suárez-Orozco, 2001b). Problems such as petrol abuse in Koori townships are indicative of the socioeconomic stresses on alienated Fourth World peoples. Perhaps media strategies—such as the perpetuation of social networks and cultural customs (Smart & Smart, 2001)—shared between immigrant and Fourth World communities, have a mutual capacity to relieve suffering and work toward a constructive model of cultural convergence.

**METHOD**

**Sampled Newspapers**

This research analyzed and compared content from four newspapers published from the start of February 2008 to near the end of January 2009. The newspapers were *El Latino (Arkansas)*, the *Koori Mail*, the *Cherokee Phoenix*, and the *Arkansas Democrat-Gazette*. The *Koori Mail* was chosen as a Fourth World model, because Robie (2005, 2008), who adapted the Four Worlds model to media studies, has repeatedly cited the fortnightly *Mail* as a prototype of Fourth World media. However, considering the transoceanic and cultural distance between Australia and Arkansas, the *Cherokee Phoenix* was adopted as a second Fourth World model. The Four Worlds concept originated with the First Nations of North America, and the monthly *Phoenix*, which focuses its coverage on the Cherokee heartland of Oklahoma, is geographically the closest First Nations publication to central Arkansas. Moreover, while the *Koori Mail* endeavors to cover Australia from coast to coast, the *Phoenix*’s focus on the sub-state region of eastern Oklahoma is more akin to *El Latino*’s
focus on central Arkansas. The *Arkansas Democrat-Gazette* was chosen because it is the principal news daily in central Arkansas, serving the same geographic market as *El Latino*, and operates in the traditional journalistic paradigm.

*El Latino* was chosen as the focus of this study in part because the rapid growth of the Hispanic population in Arkansas, a largely rural state, has created a substantial minority population that lives, geographically and socioeconomically, quite apart from the host society. The weekly *El Latino* is exclusively a Spanish-language publication, so on its face aims to serve a readership discrete from the overwhelmingly monolingual native-born population served by the *Democrat-Gazette*. *El Latino* and the central Arkansas market were chosen as the focus of this study in part because the author has substantial experience as an advocate for both the media and Hispanic communities in central Arkansas, and thus was well positioned to analyze the *Democrat-Gazette* and *El Latino* in the contexts of their home communities.

Of 52 issues of *El Latino* published from February 2008 through January 2009, 24 were selected for analysis according to a stratified sampling by which two issues were selected at random from each calendar month (Lacy, Robinson, & Riffe, 1995). Of 26 issues of the *Koori Mail* published from February 2008 through January 2009, 12 were selected for analysis according to a systematic sampling of alternating issues. All 12 print issues of the *Cherokee Phoenix* from February 2008 through January 2009 were analyzed. The *Democrat-Gazette* published 371 issues from February 1, 2008, to February 5, 2009, and 14 were selected for content analysis according to a stratified sample of two composite weeks, each from a random selection of one day per week from each six-month period (Riffe, Aust, & Lacy, 1993; Stempel, 1952).

**Content Values**

The content in each newspaper was coded first for its pertinence to Robie’s First World values, the “objectivity” series, and second to Robie’s Fourth World values, the “self-determination” series. (Definitions for each value were articulated and appear in Appendix A.) Because the author acted as a single coder, ten percent of the selected publications were re-coded to ensure reliability (Stempel, 1989). Counting every affirmative code as a single item, whether identified initially or upon re-coding, reliability was assessed at 98.6%, with a lowest reliability by publication at 97.8% for the *Cherokee Phoenix*, indicating adequate reliability.

**Analytical Methodology**

After coding and measurement of the samples according to the content values, three assessments were conducted of the data. For ease, these assessments will be referred to as
comparisons of proportions in (1) “frequency,” (2) “area average,” and (3) “area sum.”

First and principally, items responsive to each value field, in each series, were counted for each newspaper and divided by the sum of coded items for that newspaper. These frequency proportions were compared, newspaper to newspaper, using a two-sample proportion test.

The latter two assessments were conducted to ensure that the frequency proportions were not unreliable because of variations in story length. Thus second, an average was calculated of the per-item area devoted to each value field by each newspaper, relative to the sum area of coded content in that newspaper. These area-average proportions were compared using a two-sample t-test (assuming unequal variances). Area was measured in inches, rounding to the quarter-inch. For the content analyzed in this study, area (or content hole) was regarded as a superior measurement to word count, because textual and graphic content varied greatly among the newspapers. For example, the Koori Mail routinely covered significant Koori cultural events through photographic “essays,” while the Democrat-Gazette was more text-intensive.

Third, the proportion of the sum area in each newspaper that was coded affirmatively in each value field, relative to the sum area of coded content in that newspaper, was calculated. These area-sum proportions were not analyzed statistically because the quarter-square-inch was not a sufficiently fixed unit of measurement of population size to render a reliable estimation of significance.

D. Limitations. With its focus on El Latino and central Arkansas, this study is quite limited in its capacity to derive generalized conclusions. Short of generalizations, it was the author’s hope that the study at least would yield results of sufficiently compelling interest as to generate discussion and perhaps further research on the relevance of the Four Worlds model to immigrant media, especially amid the changing dynamics of global human migration. If the Four Worlds model is relevant to immigrant media and the migration experience, then media studies might lead to the formulation of a content selection and values strategy that works better than the First World paradigm to resolve the conflicts and work through the issues that confront immigrant communities within First World societies.

RESULTS

First and Fourth World Baselines

Consistently with the design of this study (see Table 2), it was expected that as Fourth World models, the Koori Mail and Cherokee Phoenix, would reflect Fourth World values as well as or better than the First World model would. Considering the frequency results (Tables 3 and 4), this expectation came substantially, but not entirely, to pass. The Fourth
Table 2. Overall Volume of Data Collection

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>EL</th>
<th>KM</th>
<th>CF</th>
<th>DG</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>no items</td>
<td>537</td>
<td>1580</td>
<td>772</td>
<td>1815</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>sum area (in²)</td>
<td>25455.0</td>
<td>104376.6</td>
<td>40232.2</td>
<td>92893.6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>avg. area (in²)</td>
<td>47.4</td>
<td>66.1</td>
<td>52.1</td>
<td>51.2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>sum area (cm²)</td>
<td>164225.5</td>
<td>673392.2</td>
<td>259862.1</td>
<td>599312.3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>avg. area (cm²)</td>
<td>305.8</td>
<td>426.2</td>
<td>336.2</td>
<td>330.2</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

World models both exceeded the Democrat-Gazette in representations of (1) independent voice, (2) language, (3) culture, and (6) Fourth World conflict. The Cherokee Phoenix, but not the Koori Mail, outperformed the Democrat-Gazette on (4) education, and the Mail but not the Phoenix outperformed the Democrat-Gazette on (5) inter-group solidarity. Within the Fourth World value series, the Democrat-Gazette significantly outperformed only the Koori Mail, only as to education.

Statistical comparison of area data (Table 5 and 6) in the Fourth World value series was usually not possible because of the low representation of Fourth World values in the Democrat-Gazette, a fact that bolstered the expected frequency results. Among the area statistics (Tables 6 and 7) that could be derived, average story size on independent voice in the Koori Mail was not significantly distinguishable from that in the Democrat-Gazette, a result that neither bolstered nor contradicted the frequency result. Average story size on education in the Koori Mail was not significantly distinguishable from that in the Democrat-Gazette, a result that undermined the only frequency result reflecting favorable Democrat-Gazette performance on a Fourth World value. The low representations of education in the Mail and inter-group solidarity in the Phoenix suggested that perhaps Fourth World media do not uniformly model those values, or those newspapers uncharacteristically underrepresented those values. However, those possibilities are cast into doubt by the area data, which showed, on average, shorter education items in the Democrat-Gazette than in the Koori Mail, putting the two on par, and too few solidarity items in the Democrat-Gazette to compare statistically to the Cherokee Phoenix. Only in those respects did the area data contradict the frequency results, and that contradiction only added credibility to the Mail and Phoenix as Fourth World models.

It was further expected that as a First World model, the Democrat-Gazette would reflect First World values as well as or better than both Fourth World models would. This expectation came to pass as to (4) oddity, (6) First World conflict, and (7) disaster. The Democrat-Gazette significantly surpassed only the Cherokee Phoenix Fourth World model.
on (3) personality. Unexpectedly, both Fourth World models better than the Democrat-Gazette reflected the First World values of (2) proximity and (5) human interest, and the Cherokee Phoenix better than the Democrat-Gazette reflected the First World value of (1) timeliness.

Area data on the First World value series tell a different story from the frequency results, thus casting the frequency results into some doubt. Likely owing to its abundance of section-front briefs, and despite its broadsheet format, the Democrat-Gazette tended to run shorter stories, on average, than all three other newspapers. Thus the area data in general point to a higher representation of nearly all values, including First World values, in the other three newspapers, when measured by average story size. Where the First World results were inverted from expectation, the shorter stories in the Democrat-Gazette of course yielded area data that bolstered the frequency lead of the Koori Mail and Cherokee Phoenix. But where frequency results were consistent with expectations, the shorter stories in the Democrat-Gazette yielded area data that contradicted the frequency lead of the Mail and Phoenix. Exceptional in this regard, where statistical analysis was possible, was the average story size in the Koori Mail–Democrat-Gazette comparison on human interest, where the Democrat-Gazette led, and in the Koori Mail–Democrat-Gazette comparison on personality, where the two were not significantly distinguishable.

Whether the area statistics are sufficiently powerful to overcome the frequency results in any respect is a subjective question. Importantly, statistical comparison was not possible on (4) oddity because of the low representation in all newspapers. Statistical comparison was not possible on (7) disaster because of low representation in all but the Democrat-Gazette, thus bolstering the frequency result. These two values were two of the three First World

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Value</th>
<th>EL</th>
<th>KM</th>
<th>CP</th>
<th>DG</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>TIMELY</td>
<td>.24</td>
<td>.80</td>
<td>.86</td>
<td>.78</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>NEAR</td>
<td>.30</td>
<td>.32</td>
<td>.33</td>
<td>.28</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>PERSON</td>
<td>.17</td>
<td>.15</td>
<td>.61</td>
<td>.12</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ODD</td>
<td>.26</td>
<td>.03</td>
<td>.31</td>
<td>.13</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>HUMAN</td>
<td>.10</td>
<td>.11</td>
<td>.13</td>
<td>.75</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CNFLCT</td>
<td>.25</td>
<td>.44</td>
<td>.51</td>
<td>.10</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>DISASTR</td>
<td>.28</td>
<td>.02</td>
<td>.10</td>
<td>.89</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>VOICE</td>
<td>.38</td>
<td>.49</td>
<td>.48</td>
<td>.34</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>LANGE</td>
<td>.37</td>
<td>.08</td>
<td>.93</td>
<td>.01</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CULTUR</td>
<td>.30</td>
<td>.13</td>
<td>.43</td>
<td>.09</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>EDUC</td>
<td>.14</td>
<td>.19</td>
<td>.38</td>
<td>.33</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SOLID</td>
<td>.19</td>
<td>.20</td>
<td>.03</td>
<td>.01</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CNFLCT</td>
<td>.09</td>
<td>.39</td>
<td>.39</td>
<td>.01</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
strongholds, the third being First World conflict, in that only on those First World values did frequency results point to the Democrat-Gazette as an exemplar to the exclusion of the Fourth World models. Thus the scope of uncertainty generated by the disparity in average story size between the Democrat-Gazette and the other newspapers is limited.

El Latino

On the First World values of (1) timeliness and (5) human interest, El Latino amplified the Fourth World models' tendency to outpace the Democrat-Gazette, results bolstered by area data. El Latino tended weakly to the Fourth World baseline on (6) First World conflict, with inconclusive area data. El Latino performance was inconclusive on (2) proximity, where the four newspapers were difficult to distinguish, on (3) personality, where the Fourth World models diverged, and on (7) disaster, where El Latino fell between the First and Fourth World baselines. El Latino exhibited a First World performance on (4) oddity.

In the Fourth World value series, El Latino more consistently tracked its Fourth World counterparts, joining leads over the Democrat-Gazette in (1) independent voice, (2) language, and (3) culture. El Latino performance on frequency data was inconclusive on (4) education and (5) inter-group solidarity, where the First and Fourth World baselines were difficult to distinguish, and on (6) Fourth World conflict, where El Latino fell between the
First and Fourth World baselines. On none of the Fourth World values did El Latino track Democrat-Gazette performance.

On balance, then, El Latino bears greater resemblance to the Fourth World models than to the First World model, tracking the former on three of seven First World values—timeliness, human interest, and First World conflict—and on at least three of six Fourth World values—indat, voice, language, and culture—and tracking the Democrat-Gazette on only one value: First World oddity. El Latino comparisons were inconclusive on First World proximity, personality, and disaster, and on Fourth World education, solidarity, and conflict. On no value did the area data push the frequency results back against the hypothesis, though t-tests were not always possible for lack of sufficient responsive items.

**DISCUSSION**

This paper advanced the hypothesis that El Latino would bear a greater resemblance to the Koori Mail and Cherokee Phoenix than to the Democrat-Gazette when analyzed according to First and Fourth World news values. Unexpectedly, the Fourth World models exemplified some First World values better than the First World model; nevertheless, baselines were established in accordance with the models. In analysis of El Latino, the hypothesis was partially borne out by the data. In the seven-part First World value series, the hypothesis was born out on three values; three values proved inconclusive; and one value contradicted the hypothesis. In the six-part Fourth World value series, the hypothesis was born out on three values, and three values proved inconclusive. Some distortion in the results...
might be explained by the greater reliance of the Democrat-Gazette and El Latino, than the Mail and Phoenix, on commercial advertising, and by the shorter publication intervals of the former two newspapers. Still, in sum, El Latino demonstrated substantial Fourth World character. That resemblance, as well as the points of divergence, raises implications for further study of media oriented toward immigrant populations.

First World Values Supporting the Hypothesis:
Timeliness, Human Interest, and Conflict

On these three values, El Latino looked more like a Fourth World newspaper than a First World newspaper.

As to timeliness, this result signifies a higher representation of the value in El Latino and the Fourth World baseline than in the Democrat-Gazette. That result is in part a function of publication interval and points to lack of uniformity in that respect as a limitation of this study. As a fortnightly and a monthly respectively, the Koori Mail and Cherokee Phoenix cover much more time in a given issue than the daily Democrat-Gazette. Because timeliness was assessed relative to the interval of publication, a story in a newspaper with a longer interval was more likely to be responsive, whereas the Democrat-Gazette has the luxury, or
Table 7. Area-Span Data (5)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>EE</th>
<th>KM</th>
<th>CP</th>
<th>DS</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>TIMELY</td>
<td>75.1</td>
<td>80.2</td>
<td>64.3</td>
<td>71.3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>NEAR</td>
<td>31.3</td>
<td>32.4</td>
<td>35.3</td>
<td>30.4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>PERSON</td>
<td>16.5</td>
<td>16.4</td>
<td>7.4</td>
<td>18.0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>OLD</td>
<td>1.4</td>
<td>0.3</td>
<td>0.3</td>
<td>1.2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>HUMAN</td>
<td>11.8</td>
<td>11.0</td>
<td>15.0</td>
<td>12.7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CNFLCT</td>
<td>2.2</td>
<td>4.6</td>
<td>4.4</td>
<td>9.0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>DISASTR</td>
<td>2.3</td>
<td>0.3</td>
<td>1.0</td>
<td>4.4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>VOICE</td>
<td>40.9</td>
<td>49.8</td>
<td>49.1</td>
<td>13</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>LANGE</td>
<td>3.4</td>
<td>0.3</td>
<td>8.3</td>
<td>0.0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CULTUR</td>
<td>27.9</td>
<td>35.9</td>
<td>40.2</td>
<td>0.9</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>EDUC</td>
<td>17.3</td>
<td>3.3</td>
<td>4.9</td>
<td>2.5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SOLID</td>
<td>2.0</td>
<td>2.7</td>
<td>0.2</td>
<td>0.0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CNFLCT</td>
<td>0.8</td>
<td>4.2</td>
<td>5.2</td>
<td>0.4</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

the pressure, to produce more time-independent feature content to fill its pages. As a weekly, El Latino publishes more frequently than the Fourth World models, but not as frequently as the Democrat-Gazette. At the same time, an issue of El Latino fills a much smaller content hole than a week's Democrat-Gazette, exaggerating timeliness. It would be useful in subsequent research to identify and study periodicals with common intervals. Still, to the extent that Fourth World newspapers in general tend to longer publication intervals than traditional dailies, the result is meaningful.

As to human interest, again, this result signifies a higher representation of the value in El Latino and the Fourth World baseline than in the Democrat-Gazette. The Koori Mail routinely profiled ethnic high school and professional athletes, as well as ethnic persons assuming offices in mainstream bureaucratic and political affairs. Cherokee Phoenix human interest coverage also emphasized ethnic persons successful in mainstream affairs, especially in U.S. military service. Human interest is emphasized as a value in both public journalism and development journalism, and the holding up of role models seemed to serve the same function in the Fourth World models. El Latino was not devoid of such items, but its human interest coverage, akin to the recurring "My Family" feature in the Koori Mail, more often depicted ordinary individuals, especially in recurring person-on-the-street features and society pages. Whatever their differences, human interest coverage in these three newspapers routinely depicted ethnic subjects in a positive light. In contrast, more scarce Democrat-Gazette human interest content sometimes highlighted achievement or daily life, but included too a generous measure of contemplative first-person columns and second-person advice columns. El Latino therefore reflected the Fourth World take on human interest thematically, as well as numerically.

As to First World conflict, this result signifies a lower representation of the value in
El Latino and the Fourth World baseline than in the Democrat-Gazette, though not overwhelmingly so. Conflict coverage in the Democrat-Gazette arose principally in connection with international news, especially U.S. wars in Iraq and Afghanistan. In contrast, traditional conflict coverage in the Cherokee Phoenix and Koori Mail overlapped almost entirely with Fourth World cultural conflicts, involving disputes with mainstream authorities over civil rights and land use. Conflict coverage in El Latino exhibited a mix of these priorities. Traditional conflict in El Latino sometimes emphasized clashes between Latino and mainstream U.S. interests over immigration. But much of El Latino’s conflict coverage drew on international news, usually focusing on Latin America, especially concerning drug trafficking-related violence. Thus El Latino tended to the Fourth World example quantitatively, but conflict content did not exclusively overlap with intercultural conflict.

Here it merits mention that the Democrat-Gazette and El Latino are both purely commercial enterprises, in contrast with the Cherokee Phoenix and Koori Mail, which are owned by indigenous organizations. The partial qualitative similarity then between El Latino and the Democrat-Gazette conflict coverage might be a function of market demand. That El Latino nevertheless tracked more closely quantitatively with the Fourth World baseline is therefore indicative of only a stronger-than-appears similarity with Fourth World values. In contrast, this difference became salient on the Fourth World conflict value, discussed below.

First World Values Inconclusive: Proximity, Personality, and Disaster

On these three values, El Latino did not clearly better track the First World or Fourth World baseline.

Little can be said of proximity, because the four newspapers were difficult to distinguish on that score. Proximity was more frequent in the Fourth World baseline than in the Democrat-Gazette, likely owing to the related emphasis on human interest, explained above, in parallel with the public and development journalism models. But the difference between the baselines was not so great that El Latino can be said to have gravitated one way or the other.

As to personality, the Koori Mail and Cherokee Phoenix diverged too greatly to establish a useful Fourth World baseline. The Cherokee Phoenix departed from the example of the three other newspapers in underemphasis of personality. Both the Koori Mail and Cherokee Phoenix emphasized ethnic personalities in the news, but the Mail also heeded the interactions of mainstream personalities, especially politicians such as the Australian prime minister, with ethnic persons and issues. That the Cherokee Phoenix did not do so might be a value choice, or might reflect the fact that indigenous issues are more central to Australian than to American politics. Either way, if the Koori Mail set the standard for personality coverage, then it is difficult to distinguish El Latino from the Mail or Democrat-Gazette.
the Cherokee Phoenix set the standard, then El Latino adhered more closely to the example of the Democrat-Gazette. Because much of El Latino’s personality-driven coverage arose from the 2008 U.S. presidential election, focusing on candidates and ethnic issues, the Koori Mail standard is the better one.

As to disaster, El Latino fell between the baselines. Qualitatively, disaster coverage in El Latino followed a pattern similar to conflict coverage, favoring news from Latin America, but not otherwise expressing any cultural perspective. Disastrous events reported in El Latino included disease and crime-related deaths in Mexico, Argentina, and India; plane crashes in Spain and New York; and natural disasters in Mexico, Chile, and China. In large part, this disaster coverage was a function of El Latino’s constructed, pan-ethnic readership, with its wide geographic interest in origin-country news. In this manner, El Latino truly differed from the Fourth World example, which was typified by the concentrated geographic interests of the Cherokee Nation, or the focused if dispersed interests of indigenous Australians. But El Latino’s gravitation toward the Democrat-Gazette example might also, again, reflect the commercial imperative that those newspapers share, as discussed above in connection with conflict. The Democrat-Gazette eagerly reported on earthquakes in the Caribbean, Chechnya, and Pakistan, and snowstorms and fires on the U.S. coasts, even though no disaster was reported proximate to central Arkansas. The commercial imperative likely exaggerated El Latino’s relative inclination to report disaster unrelated to Latin America.

First World Value Contradicting the Hypothesis: Oddity

On this value, El Latino looked more like a First World newspaper than a Fourth World newspaper. Along with First World conflict and disaster, oddity may be regarded as a stronghold First World value; it characterizes the conventional image, at least, of powerfully commercially motivated, sensationalist First World media, to the exclusion of values shared with the more idealistic models of public and development journalism. Even from a less skeptical perspective, oddity reporting is entertainment, devoid of practical value, thus an extravagance more likely to fill the ample content hole of a First World newspaper; oddity reporting is not as likely to appear in the survival-minded development medium. Oddity-responsive items demonstrate this value disparity. The Democrat-Gazette tended to report oddity for its own sake, for example featuring offbeat items in a regular column, uninspired by any other unifying value. Meanwhile, rare oddity in the Koori Mail tended to be responsive simultaneously to human interest, and to showcase the achievements of indigenous persons: “amputee golfer,” “crime-fighting nan,” “hero husband fights off croc.” The sole odd item in the Cherokee Phoenix similarly profiled a 106-year-old Cherokee national. Odd items in El Latino decidedly followed the Democrat-Gazette example, drawing on news from around the world, if with a favoritism for Mexico, but not casting subjects in...
the role of protagonist—e.g., stories about an overweight groom and overweight police. The commercial imperative again must be considered as an incentive for this value expression in El Latino. It seems likely too, though, that El Latino and its readership, even while socioeconomically disadvantaged, are figuratively more distant than the Fourth World communities from the desperate circumstances of life in much of the developing world, and are thus more inclined to value information purely for entertainment value.

Fourth World Values Supporting the Hypothesis:
Independent Voice, Language, and Culture

On these three values, El Latino looked more like a Fourth World newspaper than a First World newspaper. These three values represent the Fourth World stronghold, as they directly reflect ethnic identity in Fourth World life. Thus El Latino’s expression of these values is powerfully probative of the hypothesis.

As to independent voice and culture, the values were reflected heavily in El Latino content, presenting Latino perspectives on current events, and highlighting Latino identity. El Latino, the Koori Mail, and the Cherokee Phoenix all highlighted the ethnic identity of achievers in politics, athletics, and the arts, as well as ordinary individuals role-modeling studying, job hunting, child-rearing, and voting. All three publications devoted considerable space to culturally significant events such as Cinco de Mayo, National Sorry Day, and the Cherokee National Holiday. In contrast, these values were expressed only rarely in the Democrat-Gazette. Independent voice appeared in occasional stories specifically about organizations advocating for African-American civil rights, and periodically in news stories involving intercultural conflict over issues such as immigration and criminal justice. Democrat-Gazette cultural coverage was thin, turning up in news, food, and travel—and making no mention of Cinco de Mayo in the voluminous Sunday edition closest (4 May) to the day. Though independent voice and culture in El Latino were diminished by roughly 20% and 30-50% respectively (both frequency and area) from their representations in the Koori Mail and Cherokee Phoenix, the values still played a powerful role in El Latino content.

The publications varied in their use of language, El Latino publishing in Spanish, the Democrat-Gazette and Koori Mail in English, and the Cherokee Phoenix principally in English but with some content side-by-side with translation into the Cherokee syllabary. In this literal sense, El Latino exemplified the Fourth World value better than the other publications. But that measure is not a wholly fair assessment of the Mail and Phoenix, as there is too little fluency today in indigenous languages, in Australia or the Cherokee Nation, to render an indigenous-language publication practical. Accordingly, the definition of language for this study (Appendix A) was broadened and adapted to account for content favorable toward indigenous language. The Cherokee translations were included, because
the purpose of the modern (1819) syllabary is to preserve the formerly unwritten language. Under this modified standard, language stories did not abound, but appeared occasionally. *El Latino* referred readers to Spanish-language television programming and carried two stories on civic participation for Spanish-speakers. The *Koori Mail* and *Cherokee Phoenix*, besides the latter's translations, carried a smattering of stories on indigenous language revival and preservation, and both newspapers reported skeptically on efforts to further the dominance of English. The sole language-responsive story in the *Democrat-Gazette* highlighted the decidedly different perspective of Arkansan evangelists translating the Bible into indigenous African languages.

**Fourth World Values Inconclusive:**

**Education, Inter-Group Solidarity, and Fourth World Conflict**

On these three values, *El Latino* did not clearly better track the First World or Fourth World baseline.

The difficulty with education arose in that only one of the Fourth World models, the *Cherokee Phoenix*, outpaced the *Democrat-Gazette*. The *Koori Mail* devoted few items to education with sparse public-health coverage. The *Phoenix* also covered public health, but added cultural education and civic participation to its priorities, advising readers on Cherokee history and customs, as well as smart shopping and tax law. *El Latino* emulated *Phoenix* coverage with attention to public health and civic issues such as politics and taxes. But *El Latino* devoted vastly more space to reader education. In addition to periodic stories on events such as Valentine's Day and Daylight Savings Time, surveyed editions of *El Latino* included special editions on schools, small business, and employment. An annual special edition devoted entirely to orient new immigrants covered U.S. holidays, banking, healthcare, recreation, libraries, criminal procedure, local history, and even metric conversion. The education value manifested in *Democrat-Gazette* coverage with a frequency akin to the *Phoenix*, but with shorter stories of a lighter character. Education content included homemaking tips on cleaning, food, gardening, and gadgetry; and advice on exercise and travel. Only rare items—social security advice, storm recovery information, and car repair instructions—regarded weightier matters or life essentials. While the *Mail* and *Phoenix* cannot uniformly be distinguished from the *Democrat-Gazette* in statistical terms, the runaway education content of *El Latino* is irrefutably in sync with both Fourth World models thematically.

A similar difficulty pertained to inter-group solidarity in that of the Fourth World models, only the *Koori Mail* outpaced the *Democrat-Gazette*. The *Cherokee Phoenix* devoted few more items to solidarity than did the *Democrat-Gazette*. *Koori Mail* coverage reflected indigenous Australians' common struggles with other ethnic minorities in Oceania and Southeast Asia, and recognized the significance for minority civil rights of the U.S.
election of an African-American president. Those angles had no parallel in the Phoenix, which expressed solidarity in only two stories, one relating violence against Cherokee and native Alaskan women, the other comparing the socioeconomic struggles of Cherokee and Hispanic communities. The inter-group solidarity value was modified for the native-oriented Democrat-Gazette to detect any expression of solidarity with or among cultural minority groups, but still the newspaper produced only a single responsive story, covering the multiethnic turnout for a vigil honoring Martin Luther King. El Latino manifested the solidarity value more frequently than the Phoenix and Democrat-Gazette, but not as frequently as the Mail, and that coverage was driven by solidarity with African-American political interests, especially the Obama candidacy. Thus amid divergent Fourth World models, one in accord with the Democrat-Gazette, El Latino fell in between.

It merits mention as well that El Latino expressed solidarity in a manner not recognized in the design of this study. As is characteristic of Hispanic and Latino publications in the United States, El Latino brought news and culture from throughout Latin America to the common umbrella of a Spanish-speaking readership. This study defined solidarity as external to the readership, so for this purpose, the pan-ethnic Latino construct was regarded as non-responsive intra-group solidarity. Nevertheless, the pan-ethnic construct inclined El Latino toward the Koori Mail. “Koori” is conventionally understood to refer to southeastern Australia, namely peoples indigenous to present-day New South Wales, Victoria, and Tasmania. And while the Mail exhibited an editorial focus on that region, home to the indigenous ownership, the newspaper reported indigenous news nationwide, recognizing tribal distinctions only in a positive light and purporting to unite all indigenous persons under the Koori banner. In contrast, the Cherokee Phoenix dedicated itself to the Cherokee Nation identity, even to the exclusion of the Eastern Band Cherokee; again, Fourth World models diverged. But El Latino’s construction of a pan-ethnic identity was decidedly analogous to the Koori Mail conception.

As to Fourth World conflict, the Koori Mail and Cherokee Phoenix adequately exemplified a Fourth World baseline apart from the Democrat-Gazette, and El Latino fell comfortably between the baselines. As explained above in connection with First World conflict, the Mail and Phoenix reported conflicts almost exclusively of a cultural nature, such as civil rights and land disputes, while most conflicts reported by the Democrat-Gazette were of an international political or military nature, without express cultural dimension. The only two exceptional Democrat-Gazette stories concerned the civil rights of persons involved in criminal matters, one an African-American defendant and one a Mexican national in U.S. custody. El Latino covered less conflict overall than the other three publications, aligning it on First World conflict with the Fourth World models. However, as to cultural conflict, El Latino fell in between the baselines: a significant number of conflicts over culturally loaded issues such as immigration, but most conflict coverage without express cultural dimension.
CONCLUSION

This study operationalized the Four Worlds model for mass media values in a new context, that of a foreign-language newspaper serving a recent-immigrant community within a First World society, namely a Hispanic community in central Arkansas, in the United States. The study established baseline representations of previously described First World and Fourth World values in a First World newspaper, the Democrat-Gazette, and in two Fourth World newspapers, the Koori Mail and Cherokee Phoenix. The First World model served the mainstream, host society in the same geographic area, central Arkansas, as the immigrant-oriented newspaper, El Latino. The Fourth World models served paradigmatic Fourth World communities of indigenous persons in Australia and the United States.

The study speculated that the central Arkansas Hispanic community exists with a measure of physical and cultural separation from the mainstream, host society—arising from informal barriers such as socioeconomic status, residential neighborhoods, language, and racism—and that that separation is analogous to the separation of a Fourth World society from its surrounding, mainstream society. Accordingly, the study predicted that El Latino content would bear greater similarity with the Fourth World baseline than with the First World baseline. It was hoped that this result would stimulate further research into similarities between immigrant groups and Fourth World communities, that they might share in the development of innovative strategies in their common pursuit of socioeconomic development for their peoples while preserving their cultural integrity and ethnic identity.

When the Spanish-language El Latino was compared with First World and Fourth World models, the hypothesis was substantially but not wholly born out. El Latino tracked the Fourth World baselines on six of the thirteen values surveyed, First and Fourth World. Results were inconclusive on six more values, four because the Fourth World models diverged, and two because El Latino fell in between the baselines. And El Latino tracked the First World baseline on only one value: First World "oddity."

The study is extremely limited in its capacity to found generalizations. The central Arkansas publications were chosen in part because of the author's familiarity with the Hispanic community and media market there; there is no evidence to indicate whether that market is representative of others. Moreover, this study did not account for all factors that would ensure the comparability of the publications. Notably, the daily Democrat-Gazette and weekly El Latino work with shorter publication intervals than the fortnightly Koori Mail and monthly Cherokee Phoenix. All of the publications purport to operate with editorial independence, but while El Latino and the Democrat-Gazette depend on advertising for commercial viability, the Mail and Phoenix are owned by indigenous leadership and therefore enjoy some insulation from commercial imperatives.

Nevertheless, points on which the hypothesis was supported, unsupported, or
contradicted may be informative in beginning to articulate the position of the immigrant newspaper in the constellation of the Four Worlds model. *El Latino* bore characteristics of both First and Fourth World. In the First World value series, *El Latino*'s divergence from the Fourth Worlds models on oddity, and in part on disaster, probably reflects the commercial imperative that *El Latino* shares with the *Democrat-Gazette*. Readers must be enticed to pick up *El Latino*, and oddity and disaster are hallmarks of the stereotypical Western sensationalism that bolsters newsstand performance. The divergence might instruct that cultural communities desirous of media that focus on development priorities, to the exclusion of First World commercialism, must be prepared to support their publications with indigenous ownership. Further research is warranted into the media ownership and editorial control in ethnic, immigrant, and Fourth World media.

In the Fourth World value series, *El Latino* bore a striking resemblance to the Fourth World baseline in reflecting those models in the three defining Fourth World values, those that reflect ethnic identity, and moreover in publishing in the Spanish language. Importantly too, and characteristically of Latino and Hispanic media, *El Latino* and the *Koori Mail* created a form of solidarity in the construction and reinforcement of a pan-ethnic identity, though solidarity of that nature was not measured in the study. *El Latino* straddled the First World-Fourth World fence on the expression of intercultural conflict, indicating some alignment with First World values in carrying conflict news without a cultural dimension. That mild divergence might again be explained by the commercial imperative, which would support the exaggeration of conflict without impact specific to the readership. Further research is warranted into the common interests and variable media market dynamics of Fourth World and immigrant communities.

In sum, then, *El Latino* does point to substantial similarity between the disposition of the Hispanic community within First World central Arkansas, and the disposition of Koori and Cherokee communities within U.S. and Australian societies. The divergences, where *El Latino* seems to share the commercial imperative of First World media, may be explained in terms of *El Latino*'s commercial ownership and business model. However, the extent to which *El Latino* takes on characteristics of mainstream media might also be a reflection of the acculturation process. That is, on one side of the coin, *El Latino* embellishes its substantial independent voice, cultural, and education content with a dose of oddity, disaster, and extra-cultural conflict to appeal to readers. But on the flip side of the same coin, *El Latino* readers must desire those First World-style stories in a manner to which Koori and Cherokee readers are not accustomed. Possibly that desire is a reflection of the extent to which immigrant Latino values are converging with the First World norms of the mainstream society. Further research is warranted into the extent to which immigrant-oriented media reflect the variable states of acculturation inherent in different immigrant communities, as well as the extent to which traditional First World media might reflect the subtle impact of acculturation on the host society.
Furthermore, if indeed the plight of immigrant communities today is changing to represent new norms, perhaps transnational identity or stalled convergence, representations of these communities might model new roles and relationships for older Fourth World communities still struggling to find their unique places in the worlds that envelope them.

REFERENCES


Editor and Publisher. (2008). Editor and Publisher international yearbook.


Richard J. Pelto-Steele  “Fourth World” Values in a Spanish-Language Newspaper


Appendix A

Definition of Content Values

First-World Value Series

(1) Timeliness. Timeliness is coded affirmatively when the story appears in the newspaper because the story reports an event that was breaking news relative to the interval of the publication. A merely timely peg in a feature story that would be of general interest at any time is not sufficient to trigger responsiveness; rather, current events must have centrally animated the story.

(2) Proximity. Proximity is coded affirmatively when the story appears in the newspaper because the story reports an event of particular relevance to people living within a geographic locality smaller than the coverage scope of the publication. A merely localizing lead, for example, the impact of a national health initiative on a local family, does not trigger responsiveness unless the local angle is pervasive or predominant in the story. For a newspaper with national readership, such as the Koori Mail, stories are responsive on this value only when the locally affected population was predominantly indigenous. Thus, a story about the opening in a Sydney gallery of an exhibition of islander art is not responsive, because the location of the event was unrelated to the indigenous community within Sydney. Similarly, coverage of an indigenous festival in Adelaide drawing participants from indigenous communities throughout South Australia is not responsive, because the location of the event was not related specifically to indigenous persons living in Adelaide, or any other locality. In contrast, a story that describes negotiations over the specific location of a natural gas facility on the predominantly indigenous Kimberley coastline was responsive, even though the story simultaneously implicated local and national interests.

(3) Personality. Personality is coded affirmatively when the story appears in the newspaper because it reports events involving public figures generally known to the contemplated reader. A public official may be a public...
figure, but is not a public figure merely by virtue of holding public office; rather, the person's name must be likely recognizable to the audience, even absent context. The mere involvement of a public figure or public figures in events reported does not trigger responsiveness; rather, the story must be substantially devoted to the role of the public figure in, or relationship to, the events reported. Thus for example a story about a new policy of U.S. President George W. Bush toward Iraq is not responsive if it broadly reflects White House strategy, but is responsive if it focuses on the involvement of Bush himself in developing the policy or in presenting it to the public.

(4) Oddity. Oddity is coded affirmatively when the story is characterized by heightened exceptionalism, exceeding the exceptionalism that ordinarily characterizes news. The responsive oddity is a highly unusual occurrence that propels the otherwise mundane onto the pages of the newspaper. For example, a record number of indigenous athletes competing in the Olympics for Australia is newsworthy, but not odd; a grandmother winning a boxing competition is odd.

(5) Human interest. Human interest is coded affirmatively when the story recites the personal experiences of discrete persons, usually of persons who are not public figures, or who were not public figures prior to the events that rendered them newsworthy, or who are public figures, but the story examined parts of their lives not ordinarily in the public light, for example, the private family life of a political campaigner. The mere presentation of professional biographical information, for example as background in a story about a previously little-known person's appointment to public office, does not trigger responsiveness; rather, the presentation of human detail must be integral to the story.

(6) Conflict. Conflict is coded affirmatively when the story is animated by an intense clash of people, organizations, nations, or cultures that exceeds mere disagreement. Even spirited disagreement over matters of public policy is not sufficient to trigger responsiveness. Thus protests and rallies are not responsive per se, but protests where violence erupted, or where strong sentiments manifested in notoriously provocative expression such as flag-burning, are responsive. Disagreements between policymakers on a public board are not responsive per se, but vituperative charges of racism arising out of those disagreements are responsive. Reports of a family's dissatisfaction with, and anger over, a coroner's investigation into the cause of death of a loved one is not responsive, but a lawsuit alleging wrongful death is responsive. Criminal justice process and native land title claims are not responsive per se, because those are routine functions of governments. But claims and disputes that are elevated to appellate contention are responsive to the conflict value. Stories that commemorate conflict, or that describe the immediate aftermath of conflict, including settlement and reconciliation, also are coded as responsive.

(7) Disaster. Disaster is coded affirmatively when the story centers on a disaster, whether tangible, such as a tsunami, or intangible, such as an economic collapse. The mere fact that tragic events result in ill effects for some people, such as a fatal car accident, does not indicate disaster, and successive and incremental bad events, such as a gradually worsening economic recession, do not indicate a disaster. Rather, a disaster, such as the crash of a commercial jetliner, is characterized by severity and suddenness from the perspectives of both persons involved and unrelated observers. A disaster can occur even when few people are injured, but the risk jeopardized many, as in the case of a criminal sniper attacking and injuring random civilians. Stories that commemorate disaster, or that describe the immediate aftermath of disaster, also are coded as responsive.

Fourth-World Value Series

(1) Independent voice. Independent voice is coded affirmatively when the story presents perspectives from persons who purport to represent, or whom readers reasonably could have perceived as representing, the
distinctive perspective of a cultural minority community. Presumably any publication with a discrete readership presents events with a gloss that favors the perspective of the readership. But in these stories, the minority perspective balances the rendition of events or distinctively animates the story. It is not presumed that only a member of a minority community can advance an independent perspective, as indigenous perspectives are commonly advanced by interest groups and government officials charged with indigenous advocacy. For example, a Koori Mail report of government grants espousing the intended benefits for indigenous persons is not responsive per se. But a report of government grants to indigenous communities is responsive when additional indigenous needs are noted by a public interest source, or by a government official who purports to represent indigenous interests. The challenge to mainstream perspective is essential for responsiveness to independent voice. Thus a Koori Mail editorial on healthcare by an indigenous representative, challenging the efficacy of government plans, is responsive. A Koori Mail man-on-the-street interview with an indigenous person is responsive to human interest, but not independent voice, when the subject matter of the interview is merely biographical, but is responsive also to independent voice when the subject matter of the interview breaches current political affairs. In the Democrat-Gazette, independent voice is coded affirmatively when the independent voice of any distinct cultural minority is asserted.

(2) Language. In Robbie’s model (2001:13), the language value is indicated by the first language of the cultural minority; in this study, however, this definition is modified and expanded to be meaningful for both the Arkansas Democrat-Gazette, which represents no minority culture, and El Latino, which is entirely in Spanish. Language is coded affirmatively when: (a) a story positively reflects the perpetuation of a minority language, for example, a story that reports that school notices to Spanish-speaking Arkansans parents will be translated into Spanish; (b) a story challenges an affront to a minority language, for example, a story about the controversy over the reduction of bilingualism in Northern Territory schools; or (c) an item is geared to educate readers in a minority language, for example, a Cherokee-language vocabulary tutorial geared to Cherokee children. The principal language of the publication or of its readership is immaterial, except that in the Cherokee Phoenix, the only paper that carries the same content in two languages, a story appearing in the Cherokee syllabary that appears alongside the same story in English is coded affirmatively.

(3) Culture. Culture is coded affirmatively when the story portrays a cultural practice distinctively related to a minority cultural community. For example, El Latino coverage of the Cinco de Mayo celebration and Koori Mail coverage of the National Sorry Day commemoration are responsive. A Koori Mail story on the appearance of Santa Claus at a Christmas event for indigenous and non-indigenous children alike is not responsive, but a story focusing on the appearance of Santa Claus specifically for the children of a local indigenous community is responsive. The Koori Mail and Cherokee News extensively cover athletes and sporting leagues either presumably or widely associated with indigenous cultural identity, but a story is marked responsive only when the indigenous connection is explicit. Stories concerning cultural products, such as the artwork of indigenous persons, are responsive, as are cultural products themselves, such as indigenous-themed reader poetry printed by the Koori Mail.

(4) Education. Education is coded affirmatively when the story has as a substantial purpose the education of the readership. All stories in a newspaper may be said to “educate” the readership in some manner, often about current events, but stories that merely inform the reader of events or studies are not coded as responsive. Similarly, a story that in some part educates a reader—such as a story about pending legislation that briefly explains a procedural rule of the assembly—is not coded as responsive. In contrast, a Koori Mail story that leads with news of a study on kidney disease, but then devotes itself in substantial part to explaining what kidney disease is and what its warning signs are, is responsive.

(5) Inter-group solidarity. Solidarity is coded affirmatively when the story favorably represents a racial or cultural
community wholly distinct from the readership of the publication, and does so in implicit or explicit comparison with the readership. Thus *Koori Mail* coverage of the 2008 U.S. presidential election is not responsive per se, but is responsive when the coverage portrays the election of an African-American candidate as indicative of the potential for racial harmony in Australia. *Cherokee Phoenix* coverage of the Eastern Band Cherokee is not responsive, because the Eastern Band is politically but not racially or culturally a community wholly distinct from the Oklahoma Cherokee Nation. In the *Democrat-Gazette*, a story is coded affirmatively for solidarity when it portrays any cultural minority communities cooperating upon common interests.

(6) Conflict. Conflict is coded affirmatively when the story fits the First World definition of conflict, and the conflict aspect of the story also meet the “independent voice” value of the Fourth World series.

Excluded from coding: Paid and house advertising; mastheads; non-editorial cartoons, games, and puzzles; information for readers such as letter and contest guidelines; teasers that consisted of no more than headlines, photos, and page references; and all recurring listings of mere data.

Included in coding: Text, headlines, and graphic elements together comprise each discrete item.